CENTER for JUDICIAL ACCOUNTABILITY, INC.

Post Office Box 3002 Southampton, New York 11969 Tel. (631) 377-3583

E-Mail: <u>cja@judgewatch.org</u> Website: <u>www.judgewatch.org</u>

Elena Ruth Sassower, Director

October 28, 2011

TO: Judicial Pay Raise Advocates New York State Chief Administrative Judge Ann Pfau Former New York State Chief Judge Judith S. Kaye Family Court Judges W. Dennis Duggan & Daniel Turbow/Organizers Coalition of New York State Judicial Associations -Association of Supreme Court Justices of the State of New York New York City Supreme Court Justices Association Designated Supreme Court Justices Association New York State Court of Claims Judges (Parts B, D & E) Association New York State Surrogates Association New York State Family Court Judges Association New York City Family Court Judges Association New York City Criminal Court Judges Association New York City Civil Court Judges Association New York State City Court Judges Association New York City Housing Court Judges Association New York State District Court Judges Association Former Appellate Division, Second Department Justice Robert Spolzino Joseph L. Forstadt, Esq., Counsel/Associations of Supreme Court Justices Bar Association Leaders who testified at the July 20, 2011 public hearing Vincent E. Doyle, III, President, NYS Bar Association Roger Juan Maldonado, Chair, Council on Judicial Administration/ NYC Bar Association Stewart Aaron, President, NY Co. Lawyers' Association Leslie Kelmachter, President, NYS Trial Lawyers Association Lance D. Clarke, Past President, Nassau County Bar Association Maureen Maney, President-Elect, Women's Bar Association of the State of NY Fund for Modern Courts: Victor Kovner, former Chair Brennan Center for Justice: Michael Waldman, Executive Director J. Adam Skaggs, Senior Counsel/Democracy Program Dennis Hughes, President of New York State AFL-CIO League of Women Voters of the State of New York: Betsey B. Swan, President Citizens Union of the City of New York: Peter J. W. Sherwin, Chair/Board of Directors & Dick Dadey, Executive Director Martin Cirincione, Deputy Director/New York Prosecutors Training Institute, Inc.

Dorchen Leidholdt, Director/Ctr for Battered Women's Legal Services/Sanctuary for Families Catherine Cerulli, Associate Professor, University of Rochester School of Medicine

FROM: Elena Ruth Sassower, Director Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA)

RE: <u>Holding Government Accountable</u>: CJA's October 27, 2011 Opposition Report in Support of Legislative Override of the Commission on Judicial Compensation's Judicial Pay Recommendations & Other Relief

On October 27, 2011, the Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA) challenged the Commission on Judicial Compensation's August 29, 2011 Final Report by an Opposition Report – four originals of which we delivered to the New York City offices of Governor Cuomo, Temporary Senate President Skelos, Assembly Speaker Silver, and Chief Judge Lippman to enable these public officers to discharge their official responsibilities to protect the People of this State.

The Opposition Report demonstrates that the Commission's judicial pay raise recommendations are "fraudulent, statutorily non-conforming, and constitutionally violative". Based thereon, it seeks:

(1) legislation voiding the Commission's judicial pay raise recommendations;

- (2) repeal of the statute creating the Commission;
- (3) referral of the Commissioners to criminal authorities for prosecution; and

(4) appointment of a special prosecutor, task force, and/or inspector general to investigate the documentary and testimonial evidence of systemic judicial corruption, infesting supervisory and appellate levels and the Commission on Judicial Conduct – which the Commission on Judicial Compensation unlawfully and unconstitutionally ignored, without findings, in recommending judicial pay raises.

The "Conclusion" to the Opposition Report (at p. 37) stated that we would furnish the Opposition Report to the Commissioners and to judicial pay raise advocates so that they might rebut its presentation of fact, law, and legal argument, <u>if they could</u>. For that reason, it is herewith furnished to you, by e-mail. It is also readily accessible to you from CJA's website, <u>www.judgewatch.org</u>, most conveniently *via* the top panel "Latest News" and side panel "Judicial Compensation-NYS". The substantiating exhibits are also posted. CJA's companion letter of today's date to the Commissioners is enclosed.

We request that the judge recipients of this letter forward it to ALL the judges and former judges who testified at the Commission's July 20th hearing and/or submitted written statements to the Commission – indeed, to ALL New York State's 1,200-plus judges and such former state judges who have retired and/or resigned since 1999 – so that they, like yourselves, may have the opportunity to contest CJA's October 27, 2011 Opposition Report, <u>if they can</u>.

Judicial Pay Raise Advocates

Consistent with applicable legal principles, the failure of the Commissioners and judicial pay raise advocates to respond to CJA's Opposition Report will be deemed a concession that they cannot do so without conceding the fraud, illegality and unconstitutionality therein particularized – reinforcing the People's entitlement to all the relief sought.

Eng L.GL Xaavare

Attachment:CJA's October 27, 2011 Opposition Report,
with a link to CJA's webpage on which it and the exhibits are postedEnclosure:CJA's October 28, 2011 letter to the Commissioners

cc: Governor Andrew M. Cuomo Temporary Senate President Dean G. Skelos Assembly Speaker Sheldon Silver Chief Judge Jonathan Lippman Commission on Judicial Compensation Public & Press Post Office Box 3002 Southampton, New York 11969 Tel. (631) 377-3583

E-Mail: <u>cja@judgewatch.org</u> Website: <u>www.judgewatch.org</u>

Elena Ruth Sassower, Director Doris L. Sassower, President

October 28, 2011

TO: Commission on Judicial Compensation William C. Thompson, Jr., Chairman Richard Cotton William Mulrow Robert Fiske, Jr. Kathryn S. Wylde James Tallon, Jr. Mark Mulholland

- FROM: Elena Ruth Sassower, Director Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA)
- RE: <u>Holding Government Accountable</u>: CJA's October 27, 2011 Opposition Report in Support of Legislative Override of the Commission on Judicial Compensation's Judicial Pay Raise Recommendations & Other Relief

Yesterday, CJA challenged the Commission's August 29, 2011 Final Report by an Opposition Report – four originals of which we delivered to the New York City offices of Governor Cuomo, Temporary Senate President Skelos, Assembly Speaker Silver, and Chief Judge Lippman so that these public officers can discharge their mandatory duties to protect the People of this State.

The Opposition Report demonstrates that your judicial pay raise recommendations are "fraudulent, statutorily-non-conforming, and constitutionally violative". Based thereon, it seeks:

- (1) legislation voiding your judicial pay raise recommendations;
- (2) repeal of the statute creating the Commission;
- (3) your referral to criminal authorities for prosecution; and

(4) appointment of a special prosecutor, task force, and/or inspector general to investigate the documentary and testimonial evidence of systemic judicial corruption, infesting supervisory and appellate levels and the Commission on Judicial Conduct – which you unlawfully and unconstitutionally ignored, without findings, in recommending judicial pay raises.

Commission on Judicial Compensation

The "Conclusion" to the Opposition Report (at p. 37) stated that the Report would be furnished you to afford you the opportunity to rebut its presentation of fact, law, and legal argument, <u>if you could</u>. It is herewith attached, by e-mail. It is also readily accessible to you from CJA's website, <u>www.judgewatch.org</u>, most conveniently *via* the top panel "Latest News" and side panel "Judicial Compensation-NYS". The substantiating exhibits, virtually all in your possession, are also posted.

Should you wish to see the original of the Opposition Report, you can secure same from the <u>New</u> <u>York Law Journal</u>, as Commissioner Fiske is a member of its Board of Editors – and we delivered an original, with its two-volume exhibit compendium, to the <u>Law Journal</u> yesterday so that it could begin long-overdue, honest reporting of the judicial compensation issue for the "Bench and Bar" it purports to "serv[e]".

Needless to say, your failure to respond to CJA's Opposition Report will be deemed a concession that you cannot do so without conceding the fraud, illegality and unconstitutionality therein particularized – reinforcing the People's entitlement to all the relief sought.



Attachment: CJA's October 27, 2011 Opposition Report, with a link to CJA's webpage on which it and the exhibits are posted

cc: Governor Andrew M. Cuomo Temporary Senate President Dean G. Skelos Assembly Speaker Sheldon Silver Chief Judge Jonathan Lippman <u>New York Law Journal</u> Judicial Pay Advocates New York State Budget Direct Robert L. Megna Public & Press