

"All the News
That's Fit to Print"

The New York Times

VOL. CLX . . . No. 55,457

© 2011 The New York Times

NEW YORK, TUESDAY, JULY 5, 2011

JUDGES QUITTING AT UNUSUAL RATE AS SALARIES LAG

LAW FIRMS' RICH OFFERS

A 12-Year Pay Freeze in New York — Exits Once Were Rare

By WILLIAM GLABERSON

There is perhaps no more fitting finale to a long legal career than a judgeship. Ascending the bench after years appearing before it can bring power, respect, personal satisfaction, reasonable hours and, often, free parking. There have traditionally been few steps beyond: Retirement. Or death.

But across the country — and in New York, more than most places — being a judge has in recent years come with one big negative: the salary. New York judges have not had a raise in 12 years, making the state one of the more extreme examples of a growing pay gap nationally between judges and other professionals, including partners at top law firms, who can earn 10 times the salary of the judge before whom they are arguing a case.

Now, for the first time in memory, judges are leaving the bench in relatively large numbers — not to retire, but to return to being practicing lawyers. Turnover in New York has increased rapidly in the last few years: nearly 1 in 10 judges are now leaving annually, a new study shows.

In New York State, at least a dozen have resigned and explicitly cited the pay. The latest is James M. McGuire, a judge on the intermediate state appeals court in Manhattan, who last week resigned his position at the white marble courthouse on Madison Avenue. His judicial salary was \$144,000. He stepped down to be a partner at a law firm, Dechert LLP, where average partner pay is \$1.4 million



On Independence Day, Ready to Serve

Baba Ly, 8, took on a big role in a parade in Ridgewood, N.J., with help from his father, Amadou Ly. More photos

A City's Wrenching Budget Choices

A Fire Truck, Road Paving and Raises Compete for Priority

By KEVIN SACK

WILMINGTON, N.C. — When Engine 5 pulled up to a burning house on Woodlawn Avenue early on March 19, the firefighters were told that a man might be trapped in the back left bedroom. As two firemen trained a hose toward that corner, Capt. Don Ragavage crawled through smoke and flames to search for the missing resident.

It was an inopportune moment for the center pressure to drum

to the limit by 16 years and more than 100,000 miles of hard service, abruptly sputtered and died.

Only a month earlier, the fire chief, Buddy Martinette, had lobbied the City Council to replace the cantankerous engine at a session devoted to the latest of Wilmington's six consecutive budget gaps.

"The mechanics really don't think it will make it," the chief warned at the time.

"You need another mechanic," shot back Charlie Rivenbark, the Council's foremost fiscal cur

and once the scattered snickers quieted, none of his colleagues took issue. The fire truck fell off the table for the fifth year in a row.

Wilmington, N.C., is not Camden, N.J., which laid off half its police force this year. It is not Detroit, which is closing half of its public schools.

But like local governments across the country, the City of Wilmington has been demonstrably diminished by five years of unyielding economic despair. That a place like Wilmington, un-

Hack
A M
Oth

By S
a

The h
selves th
trove of
put it onl
aliases, a
bers, eve
members

But the
porate e
officials c
ers. They

LAW FIRMS' RICH OFFERS

A 12-Year Pay Freeze in New York — Exits Once Were Rare

By WILLIAM GLABERSON

There is perhaps no more fitting finale to a long legal career than a judgeship. Ascending the bench after years appearing before it can bring power, respect, personal satisfaction, reasonable hours and, often, free parking. There have traditionally been few steps beyond: Retirement. Or death.

But across the country — and in New York, more than most places — being a judge has in recent years come with one big negative: the salary. New York judges have not had a raise in 12 years, making the state one of the more extreme examples of a growing pay gap nationally between judges and other professionals, including partners at top law firms, who can earn 10 times the salary of the judge before whom they are arguing a case.

Now, for the first time in memory, judges are leaving the bench in relatively large numbers — not to retire, but to return to being practicing lawyers. Turnover in New York has increased rapidly in the last few years: nearly 1 in 10 judges are now leaving annually, a new study shows.

In New York State, at least a dozen have resigned and explicitly cited the pay. The latest is James M. McGuire, a judge on the intermediate state appeals court in Manhattan, who last week resigned his position at the white marble courthouse on Madison Avenue. His judicial salary was \$144,000. He stepped down to be a partner at a law firm, Dechert LLP, where average partner pay is \$1.4 million.

New York, as the state with what officials say is the longest judicial pay freeze, is the focus of a national debate about whether controversial rulings, court corruption and politicized judicial campaigns have so eroded support for courts that there is no constituency for increasing judges' pay. "I never expected to

Continued on Page A3



On Independence Day, Ready to Serve

Baba Ly, 8, took on a big role in a parade in Ridgewood, N.J., with help from his father, Amadou Ly. More ph

A City's Wrenching Budget Choices

A Fire Truck, Road Paving and Raises Compete for Priority

By KEVIN SACK

WILMINGTON, N.C. — When Engine 5 pulled up to a burning house on Woodlawn Avenue early on March 19, the firefighters were told that a man might be trapped in the back left bedroom. As two firemen trained a hose toward that corner, Capt. Don Ragavage crawled through smoke and flames to search for the missing resident.

It was an inopportune moment for the water pressure to plummet. But that is what happened when Engine 5's motor, strained

to the limit by 16 years and more than 100,000 miles of hard service, abruptly sputtered and died.

Only a month earlier, the fire chief, Buddy Martinette, had lobbied the City Council to replace the cantankerous engine at a session devoted to the latest of Wilmington's six consecutive budget gaps.

"The mechanics really don't think it will make it," the chief warned at the time.

"You need another mechanic," shot back Charlie Rivenbark, the Council's foremost fiscal curmudgeon.

Mr. Rivenbark was not smiling,

and once the scattered snickers quieted, none of his colleagues took issue. The fire truck fell off the table for the fifth year in a row.

Wilmington, N.C., is not Camden, N.J., which laid off half its police force this year. It is not Detroit, which is closing half of its public schools.

But like local governments across the country, the City of Wilmington has been demonstrably diminished by five years of unyielding economic despair. That a place like Wilmington, until recently a real estate boom town, would defer a purchase as essential as a fire truck for even one year, much less five, speaks to the withering toll.

In repeated visits over six months, Wilmington revealed itself to be typical of hundreds of American cities where the relentless drip-drip-drip of yearly contractions has gradually arrested civic momentum. As they wrangled over the 2012 budget, the city's recession-weary mayor, Bill Saffo, and his fellow Council members faced a menu of increasingly distasteful options.

For Mr. Saffo, 50, a second-generation developer whose family had prospered with the area's growth, the notion of presiding over a shrinking city was hard to



Hack A M Oth

By S
an

The ha
selves the
trove of p
put it onli
aliases, a
bers, even
members
But their
porate ex
officials or
ers. They v

And in
identities
group kno
the A-Tear
them dow
rectly, to
officials lo

The cor
curity "lac
thing more
hanging
sneered in

In rece
companies
ment sites
raised com
ingly organ
ers. On M
count for F

But much
is a fractio
vel. grow

Unusual Turnover in New York Judges as Salaries Lag

From Page A1

get rich as a judge, but I never expected to get poor either," said Robert A. Spolzino, who resigned as an appellate judge in Brooklyn two years ago to return to law practice.

Judges in New York were the best paid nationally in the 1970s. But their salaries now are ranked 46th in the country when measured by the cost of living, according to the National Center for State Courts.

Critics contend that some judges do not work very hard and that many of them would never earn the profession's top pay. Eric A. Posner, a University of Chicago law professor, argued in a law review article in 2009 with two other law professors that there was no evidence that better-paid judges did a better job.

"The absence of raises," he wrote in a recent e-mail exchange, "is a problem only if judges weren't overpaid to begin with."

Indeed, in a series of interviews, judges acknowledged that it could be difficult to make the case for a judicial pay raise in hard economic times. Justices of New York's highest-level trial court, the State Supreme Court, make \$136,700. The chief judge of the state makes \$156,000. Across the country, "there is a devaluing of the job that judges do," so there is little pressure to pay them well, said Seth S. Andersen, the executive director of the American Judicature Society in Des Moines, which studies and evaluates judicial systems.

Current and former judges described the pressures they felt in fending off offers and trying to pay for mortgages and tuition bills. Mr. Spolzino, 52, said he had expected that he would remain until retirement, as judges did in the past.

"It's very heady when you walk into a room and everybody rises, people laugh at your jokes," he said.

Emily Jane Goodman, a State Supreme Court justice in Manhattan, said the practical effect of



PHOTOGRAPHS BY RICHARD PERRY/THE NEW YORK TIMES

James McGuire, a judge on the intermediate state appeals court in Manhattan, resigned last week to be a partner at a law firm.



Emily Jane Goodman, a State Supreme Court justice in Manhattan, said she was having trouble paying for apartment fees.

her stalled pay was that she had to sell a summer home in the Hamptons and was having trouble paying for increasing fees on her two-bedroom apartment in the city.

"Here I am," Justice Goodman said, "in a position where I'm working to achieve justice for other people and I don't feel that I'm experiencing justice."

On one of his final days at the Appellate Division on Madison Avenue, Justice McGuire, who was once chief counsel to Gov.

George E. Pataki, said he had grown increasingly dismayed as the state failed year after year to raise judicial pay.

"I tormented myself for the longest period of time about whether I should go, because I love the work," he said. "And then I realized, 'I've got no choice. The only responsible thing for my family is to go.'" Justice McGuire, 57, has two children, ages 5 and 3.

In New York, the financial pressures are particularly intense because top law firms com-

pete to hire lawyers — and, now, judges. In response to questions for this article, the state's Office of Court Administration studied judicial attrition. The analysis found that in 1999, 48 of the 1,300 state judges left their positions. Last year, 110 judges left, with the number of departures increasing sharply over the last five years.

New York's chief judge, Jonathan Lippman, said in an interview that the departures showed only part of the problem. "Why would a talented lawyer," Judge Lippman asked, "want to join an institution that hasn't had even a cost of living increase in 12 years?"

The State Legislature's failure to increase judicial pay since 1999 was the subject of bitter political disputes and court battles before legislation passed in November creating a commission on judicial salaries. It is expected to decide by September whether state judicial salaries will increase and by how much.

Nationally, many judicial salaries have lagged behind the pay not only of top lawyers, but also of some academics, school administrators, elected officials and even some courthouse employees. In New York City, some law clerks earn more than the judges they work for.

The chief justice of the United States, John G. Roberts Jr., has noted that federal judicial salaries have slipped below the pay of top law school deans and other law professors and has said the pay gap could undermine the strength of the federal courts.

The salaries of state trial judges nationally rose 34 percent to a median of \$116,100 in the decade ending in 2005. But during the same period, the median partners' share of profits at large law firms jumped 141 percent to \$957,500, Roy A. Schotland, an emeritus law professor at Georgetown, showed in a law review article. In an interview, Professor Schotland, who studies state courts, said that, nationally, stagnant pay was "the single most important problem for our courts."

Inside The Times



ANDREA MOHIN/THE NEW YORK TIMES

The 'Ring' Is a Supreme Test for Opera Directors

Bryn Terfel rehearsing for the role of Wotan at the Metropolitan Opera House at Lincoln Center in April. Anthony Tommasini looks at the challenge of staging Wagner's "Ring." PAGE C1

INTERNATIONAL

Departing U.S. Envoy Sees Progress in Afghanistan

As he prepares to step down as the American ambassador to Afghanistan, Karl W. Eikenberry regrets that he will not be around to see what happens next. Mr. Eikenberry has spent nearly a decade working in Afghanistan, as a general during two tours, as a NATO official and for the past two and a half years as am-

NATIONAL

For Firearms Bureau, A Tough Chapter

The federal Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives is under scrutiny over a gun-trafficking investigation in which federal agents knowingly let weapons slip across the Mexican border. The fracas over the operation, called Fast and Furious has renewed long-simmering questions about whether the bureau should continue to exist

BUSINESS

Second Quarter Profits Offer Reading on Economy

A string of second-quarter corporate earnings announcements due over the next few weeks could confirm that companies are beginning to have a harder time. Higher gas prices are soaking up already weak consumer spending, banks are struggling and labor costs may be starting to pick up, squeezing business's profit margins meaningfully

QUOTATION OF THE DAY

"I never expected to get rich as a judge, but I never expected to get poor either,"

ROBERT A. SPOLZINO, who resigned two years ago as an appellate judge in New York, where judges have not had a pay increase for 12 years. [A3]

ARTS

Pushing Back the Limits Of Speech and Music

Brian Eno, at age 63, continues to be one of the world's most sought-after record producers, making platinum sellers with the likes of U2 and Coldplay. He remains a prolific solo artist four decades into his career, turning out three albums in the past two years. PAGE C1

SCIENCE TIMES

In the South's 'Stroke Belt,' Memory Is Also a Worry

People in the American South are known to have strokes. Now researchers have found they are also more likely to have problems with memory. PAGE D1

CHANEL

©2011 CHANEL, Inc. ®



"Tweed on Stitch" tote, \$2,600

57 RUEFFET • MADISON AVENUE • SOHO • SHORT HILLS
800.550.0005 • CHANEL.COM

CALIBRE DE CARTIER

©2010 Cartier