

**TABLE OF CONTENTS: RECORD ON APPEAL**

**Plaintiffs’ Statement Pursuant to CPLR §5531** .....xx

**Plaintiffs’ January 10, 2018 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement**  
and accompanying “legal autopsy”/analysis of November 28, 2017 Decision and  
Judgment ..... 1

**Judge Hartman’s November 28, 2017 Decision and Judgment**.....31

**Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement**.....42

**Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order** .....49

**Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order** .....52

**Plaintiffs’ August 5, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement**.....61

**Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order**.....68

\* \* \*

**PLAINTIFFS’ SEPTEMBER 2, 2016 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE,**  
**WITH STAY & TRO, as signed by Judge Roger McDonough** .....80

**Plaintiff Sassower’s September 2, 2016 Moving Affidavit** .....83

**PLAINTIFFS’ SEPTEMBER 2, 2016 SUMMONS & VERIFIED COMPLAINT** .....85

**Exhibit A:** March 23, 2016 Verified Second Supplemental Complaint in  
plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action, *CJA v. Cuomo*  
(Albany Co. #1788-2014) .....135

**Exhibit B:** March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint in plaintiffs’ prior citizen-  
taxpayer action, *CJA v. Cuomo* (Albany Co. #1788-2014) .....226

**Exhibit C:** March 31, 2015 Verified Supplemental Complaint in plaintiffs’  
prior citizen-taxpayer action, *CJA v. Cuomo* (Albany Co. #1788-  
2014) .....273

<u>Exhibit D:</u>	Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order.....	315
<u>Exhibit E:</u>	Judge McDonough’s October 9, 2014 Decision and Order .....	326
<u>Exhibit F:</u>	Judge McDonough’s June 24, 2015 Decision and Order .....	335
<u>Exhibit G:</u>	Plaintiffs’ analysis of Justice McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order.....	338
<u>Exhibit H:</u>	Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.6403-d/A.9003-d; pp. 1-2, 72-73, 94, 96-97, 100, 124-125 .....	374
<u>Exhibit I-1:</u>	Plaintiffs’ July 13, 2016 FOIL request to Comptroller’s records access officer: “State Aid to the Counties for District Attorney Salaries for Calendar Years 2010-2016” .....	384
<u>Exhibit I-2:</u>	July 20, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer .....	386
<u>Exhibit I-3:</u>	July 22, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer .....	387
<u>Exhibit J-1:</u>	Plaintiffs’ July 11, 2016 FOIL request to Criminal Justice Services and Division of the Budget records access officers: ‘The ‘plan’ to reimburse counties not covered by Judiciary Law §183-a for district attorney salaries: fiscal years 2016-17, 2015-16, and 2014-15”.....	388
<u>Exhibit J-2:</u>	July 15, 2016 e-mail from Division of Criminal Justice Services’ records access officer .....	389
<u>Exhibit J-3:</u>	August 12, 2016 e-mail from Division of Criminal Justice Services’ records access officer .....	390
<u>Exhibit J-4:</u>	July 25, 2016 letter from Division of the Budget records access officer .....	391
<u>Exhibit K:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 1, 2016 FOIL request: “Director of the Budget’s certificate of approval of the Division of Criminal Justice Services’ budget for fiscal year 2016-2017, contained in Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.6403-d/A.9003-d – & any certification by the Division of Criminal Justice Services of its own budget” .....	392

<b><u>TRANSCRIPT OF SEPTEMBER 2, 2016 ORAL ARGUMENT</u></b> .....	444
---	-----



<u>Exhibit P:</u>	April 5, 2016 complaint in <i>James Coll v. NYS Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation, NYS Legislature, NYS Governor</i> (Supreme Court/Nassau Co.).....	459
<u>Exhibit Q-1:</u>	September 9, 2016 e-mail from Secretary of the Senate .....	463
<u>Exhibit Q-2:</u>	September 9, 2016 letter from Assembly records access officer .....	464
<u>Exhibit Q-3:</u>	September 9, 2016 letter from Division of the Budget records access officer .....	465
<u>Exhibit Q-4:</u>	September 12, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer .....	466
<u>Exhibit R:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 7, 2016 e-mail to NYS’ 62 counties and their institutional/lobbying entities .....	398
	Plaintiffs’ enclosed September 7, 2016 Notice of Right to Seek Intervention .....	393
<u>Exhibit S:</u>	September 8, 2016 Affidavit of Service for plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint, Order to Show Cause, & Moving Affidavit.....	467
	<u>Plaintiffs’ September 30, 2016 Memorandum of Law in Reply &amp; in Opposition to Cross-Motion</u> .....	471
	<b><u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s DECEMBER 21, 2016 DECISION AND ORDER</u></b> .....	527
	<b><u>DEFENDANTS’ JANUARY 20, 2017 ANSWER, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin</u></b> .....	548
	<b><u>PLAINTIFFS’ FEBRUARY 15, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE, as signed by Judge Hartman on February 21, 2017</u></b> .....	536
	<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 Moving Affidavit</u> .....	538
<u>Exhibit T-1:</u>	Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	527
<u>Exhibit T-2:</u>	AAG Kerwin’s February 3, 2017 Notice of Entry.....	545
<u>Exhibit T-3:</u>	Plaintiff Sassower’s January 17, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	546

<u>Exhibit T-4:</u>	Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer to plaintiffs’ Verified Complaint, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin .....	548
<u>Exhibit U:</u>	Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis of Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order .....	554
<u>Exhibit V:</u>	Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	578
<u>Exhibit W:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 23, 2016 FOIL/records request to Secretary of Senate & Governor’s records access officer – “RE: Nomination & Confirmation of Denise Hartman to the New York Court of Claims” .....	579
<u>Exhibit W-1:</u>	September 30, 2016 e-mail response from Secretary of the Senate .....	580
<u>Exhibit W-2:</u>	September 30, 2016 acknowledgment from Governor’s records access officer.....	582
<u>Exhibit W-3:</u>	October 31, 2016 response from Governor’s records access officer .....	583
<u>Exhibit X:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 28, 2016 FOIL request to Attorney General’s records access officer – “RE: Assistant Attorney General Adrienne Kerwin & Guidelines, Policies & Procedures” .....	590
<u>Exhibit X-1:</u>	October 5, 2016 acknowledgment from Attorney General’s records access officer.....	592
<u>Exhibit X-2:</u>	November 3, 2016 response from Attorney General’s records access officer.....	593
<u>Exhibit X-3:</u>	Plaintiffs’ December 1, 2016 appeal to Attorney General’s FOIL appeals officer .....	599
<u>Exhibit X-4:</u>	December 15, 2016 determination of Attorney General’s FOIL appeals officer .....	602

**DEFENDANTS’ MARCH 22, 2017 OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS’ FEBRUARY 15, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE** .....

AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 Affirmation in Opposition.....613

<u>Exhibit A:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits).....	87
<u>Exhibit B:</u>	Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	527

<u>Exhibit C:</u> Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin.....	548
<u>AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Opposition.....</u>	616
<b><u>PLAINTIFFS’ MARCH 24, 2017 LETTER TO JUDGE HARTMAN</u></b> <b><u>“...&amp; Notice to the Attorney General”.....</u></b>	838
With 4 enclosures:	
(1) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	647
(2) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	663
(3) Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	655
(4) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	667
<b><u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s MARCH 24, 2017 SO-ORDERED LETTER .....</u></b>	840
<b><u>PLAINTIFFS’ MARCH 29, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE, WITH</u></b> <b><u>PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION &amp; TRO, as signed by Judge Hartman .....</u></b>	635
<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s March 29, 2017 Moving Affidavit.....</u>	639
<u>Exhibit 1-A:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	647
<u>Exhibit 1-B:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	651

<u>Exhibit 2-A:</u>	Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	655
<u>Exhibit 2-B:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	659
<u>Exhibit 3-A:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	663
<u>Exhibit 3-B:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	667
<b><u>PLAINTIFFS’ MARCH 29, 2017 VERIFIED SUPPLEMENTAL COMPLAINT</u></b> .....		671
<b><u>TRANSCRIPT OF MARCH 29, 2017 ORAL ARGUMENT</u></b> .....		816

**Plaintiffs’ Free-Standing Evidence**<sup>1</sup>, brought to the courthouse on March 29, 2017 to establish their *prima facie* entitlement to their requested injunctive and declaratory relief – and, following oral argument, filed in the Clerk’s Office with Judge Hartman’s original signed Order to Show Cause:

- Defendant Governor Cuomo’s original budget bills
- Defendant Governor Cuomo’s 30-day amended budget bills
- Defendant Senate’s budget bills which it purported to have “amended” on March 13, 2017 and March 20, 2017
- Defendant Assembly’s budget bills which it purported to have “amended” on March 13, 2017 and March 20, 2017
- Defendant Senate’s “one-house budget resolution”
- Defendant Assembly’s “one-house budget resolution”

---

<sup>1</sup> Itemized at ¶8 of plaintiff Sassower’s May 15, 2017 reply affidavit [R.791] and by its Exhibit 7-b [R.863].

<b><u>DEFENDANTS’ APRIL 21, 2017 OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS’ MARCH 29, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE</u></b> .....	747
<u>AAG Lynch’s April 21, 2017 Affirmation in Opposition</u> .....	747
<u>Exhibit 1:</u> Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits).....	87
<u>Exhibit 2:</u> Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	527
<u>Exhibit 3:</u> Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on February 21, 2017 (w/o affidavit & exhibits).....	536
<u>Exhibit 4:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on March 29, 2017 (w/o affidavit & exhibits).....	635
<u>Exhibit 5:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Verified Supplemental Complaint (superseding/corrected).....	671
<u>Exhibit 6:</u> print-out/summary of Assembly Actions on budget bill #A.3000D.....	753
<u>Exhibit 7:</u> page 450 of budget bill #A.3000D.....	754
<u>Exhibit 8:</u> print-out of budget bill #S.2003D.....	755
<u>Exhibit 9:</u> purported “cover page of the Judiciary budget for Fiscal Year 2017-2018, with the certification of the Chief Judge of the Court of Appeals, and approval of the then-current members of the Court of Appeals”.....	761
<u>Exhibit 10:</u> purported “cover letter, signed by John J. Flanagan and Carl E. Heastie, certifying the Legislature’s budget for Fiscal Year 2017- 2018, submitted to the Governor on December 1, 2016” .....	765
<u>AAG Lynch’s April 21, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Opposition</u> .....	766
<b><u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s APRIL 25, 2017 SO-ORDERED LETTER</u></b> .....	787
<b><u>PLAINTIFFS’ APRIL 28, 2017 LETTER TO JUDGE HARTMAN, “...Plus Notice to the Attorney General”</u></b> .....	810
<b><u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s MAY 5, 2017 SO-ORDERED LETTER</u></b> .....	815



<b><u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s MAY 5, 2017 DECISION AND ORDER</u></b> .....	49
<b><u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s MAY 5, 2017 AMENDED DECISION AND ORDER</u></b> .....	52
<b><u>Plaintiffs’ MAY 15, 2017 REPLY IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF THEIR MARCH 29, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE</u></b> .....	788
<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s May 15, 2017 Reply Affidavit</u> .....	788
Affidavit of Service, with transmitting e-mail – “Plaintiffs have no objection to your belatedly withdrawing your opposition papers and taking such other remedial steps, as is your duty to do” .....	808
<u>Exhibit 4-a:</u> Plaintiffs’ April 28, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman: “...Plus Notice to the Attorney General” .....	810
<u>Exhibit 4-b:</u> Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 So-Ordered Letter .....	815
<u>Exhibit 5:</u> Transcript of March 29, 2017 oral argument .....	816
<u>Exhibit 6-a:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman: “...& Notice to Attorney General” .....	838
<u>Exhibit 6-b:</u> Judge Hartman’s So-Ordered March 24, 2017 Letter.....	840
<u>Exhibit 6-c:</u> AG Litigation Bureau Chief Jeffrey Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	841
<u>Exhibit 6-d:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “...& notice to Attorney General” .....	842
<u>Exhibit 6-e:</u> AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	843
<u>Exhibit 6-f:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Concerns...” .....	844
<u>Exhibit 6-g:</u> AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	845
<u>Exhibit 6-h:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Thank you” .....	846
<u>Exhibit 6-i:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Awaiting the results of your review” .....	847
<u>Exhibit 6-j:</u> AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail.....	848

<u>Exhibit 6-k:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “handled appropriately in all respects by this office?” .....	849
<u>Exhibit 6-l:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail .....	850
<u>Exhibit 6-m:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AG Meg Levine: “YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED” .....	851
<u>Exhibit 6-n:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman .....	852
<u>Exhibit 6-o:</u>	Judge Hartman’s March 28, 2017 letter .....	857
<u>Exhibit 6-p:</u>	AG Supervisor Meg Levine’s March 28, 2017 e-mail: “RE: YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED” .....	858
<u>Exhibit 6-q:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to AG Supervisor Levine: “GOING UP THE SUPERVISORY LADDER – INCLUDING TO AG SCHNEIDERMAN” .....	859
<u>Exhibit 6-r:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “further notice to the highest supervisory levels of the Attorney General’s office”. .....	860
<u>Exhibit 7-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction” .....	861
<u>Exhibit 7-b:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Levine, etc.: “Request that the AG rise above his conflict of interest & do his duty to secure the TRO to which plaintiffs were entitled yesterday, as a matter of law” .....	863
<u>Exhibit 7-c:</u>	AAG Lynch’s March 30, 2017 e-mail .....	865
<u>Exhibit 7-d:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to AAG Lynch: “Your letter of retraction to Justice Hartman” .....	868
<u>Exhibit 7-e:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.: “IMMEDIATE OVERSIGHT & ACTION REQUIRED” .....	870
<u>Exhibit 7-f:</u>	Judge Hartman’s March 31, 2017 letter .....	872

<u>Exhibit 7-g:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “NYS BUDGET & the AG’s DUTY TO IMMEDIATELY SECURE A TRO, etc.” .....	773
<u>Exhibit 7-h:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 5, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “...Your duty to advise your co-defendant clients of their treason to the NYS Constitution by their behind-closed-doors, ‘3-men-in- a-room’-‘amended’ budget bills – violating Article VII, §§4, 5, 6 and Article III, §10” .....	875
<u>Exhibit 8-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	647
<u>Exhibit 8-b:</u>	March 31, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate .....	877
<u>Exhibit 8-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 4, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: “Clarifying your March 31, 2017 response...” .....	878
<u>Exhibit 8-d:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 28, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: “Clarifying the Senate’s response...” .....	879
<u>Exhibit 8-e:</u>	May 5, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate .....	882
<u>Exhibit 9-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	663
<u>Exhibit 9-b:</u>	March 31, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate .....	883
<u>Exhibit 9-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: “Clarifying your March 31, 2017 response...” .....	884
<u>Exhibit 9-d:</u>	May 11, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate .....	885
<u>Exhibit 10-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	651
<u>Exhibit 10-b:</u>	April 3, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate .....	886
<u>Exhibit 10-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: “Clarifying your April 3, 2017 response...” .....	887

<u>Exhibit 11-a:</u>	Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	655
<u>Exhibit 11-b:</u>	March 30, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer.....	888
<u>Exhibit 11-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly records access officer: “Clarifying your March 30, 2017 response...” .....	889
<u>Exhibit 11-d:</u>	May 11, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer .....	890
<u>Exhibit 12-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	667
<u>Exhibit 12-b:</u>	March 30, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer.....	891
<u>Exhibit 12-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly records access officer: “Clarifying your March 30, 2017 response...” .....	892
<u>Exhibit 12-d:</u>	May 11, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer .....	893
<u>Exhibit 13-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	659
<u>Exhibit 13-b:</u>	April 3, 2017 acknowledgment from Assembly records access officer .....	659
<u>Exhibit 13-c:</u>	Assembly’s April 13, 2017 response .....	895
<u>Exhibit 13-d:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly records access officer: “Clarifying your April 13, 2017 response...” .....	896
<u>Exhibit 13-e:</u>	May 11, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer .....	897
<u>Exhibit 14-a:</u>	State Operations Budget Bill #S.2000-D/A.3000-D (p. 1) .....	898
<u>Exhibit 14-b:</u>	Excerpts – State Operations Bill #S.2000/A.3000 (original).....	899
<u>Exhibit 15-a:</u>	Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.2003-D/A.3003-D (p. 1).....	909
<u>Exhibit 15-b:</u>	Excerpts – Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.2003/A.3003 (original).....	910

Plaintiffs’ May 15, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Reply and in Further Support  
of March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause .....922

Affidavit of Service, with transmitting e-mail – “Plaintiffs have no objection to  
your belatedly withdrawing your opposition papers and taking such other  
remedial steps, as is your duty to do” .....989

**Plaintiffs’ May 19, 2017 letter, enclosing subpoenas *duces tecum*  
in reply & in further support of their March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause** .....991

Plaintiffs’ Subpoena *Duces Tecum* to Secretary of the Senate .....992

Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request  
to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’  
of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....647

Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request  
to Secretary of the Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’  
of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002  
for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....651

Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request  
to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’  
of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....663

Plaintiffs’ Subpoena *Duces Tecum* to Assembly records access officer .....994

Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request  
to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’  
of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....655

Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request  
to Assembly records access officer: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’  
of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002  
for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....659

Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request  
to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’  
of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....667

**AAG Kerwin’s May 23, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman**.....996

**PLAINTIFFS’ JUNE 12, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE,  
as signed by Judge Hartman on June 16, 2017** .....997

Plaintiff Sassower’s June 12, 2017 Moving Affidavit.....999

Exhibit A-1: AAG Kerwin’s May 11, 2017 Notice of Entry.....1011

Exhibit A-2: Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order.....49

Exhibit B-1: AAG Kerwin’s May 11, 2017 Notice of Entry.....1012

Exhibit B-2: Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order .....52

Exhibit C: Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 Notice of Appeal,  
with Pre-Calendar Statement .....42

Exhibit D: Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.....1013

Exhibit E: Plaintiffs’ analysis of AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 opposition  
to plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause.....1014

Exhibit F: Plaintiff April 10, 2017 complaint to Third Judicial District  
Administrative Judge Breslin: “IMMEDIATE SUPERVISORY  
OVERSIGHT REQUIRED: willful, deliberate, and purposeful  
violation of State Finance Law §123-c(4) by Acting Supreme  
Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman”.....1039

Exhibit G: Plaintiffs’ April 21, 2017 complaint to Deputy Chief  
Administrative Judge Michael Coccoma: “IMMEDIATE  
SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT REQUIRED – Misconduct  
Complaint against Third Judicial District Administrative Judge  
Thomas A. Breslin & his highest-ranking administrative staff,  
District Executive Beth A. Diebel and Deputy District Executive  
Christy Q. Bass, for aiding and abetting the willful, deliberate, and  
purposeful violation of State Finance Law §123-c(4) by Acting  
Supreme Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman  
– & by Senior Court Reporter Cindy Affinati”.....1052

Plaintiffs’ Affidavit of Service for signed June 12, 2017 Order to Show Cause,  
with transmitting e-mail “...NOTICE TO SUPERVISORY/MANAGERIAL  
LEVELS, INCLUDING DEFENDANT AG SCHNEIDERMAN” .....1067

**JUDGE HARTMAN’S JUNE 26, 2017 DECISION AND ORDER.....68**

**DEFENDANTS’ JULY 21, 2017 OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS’ JUNE 21, 2017  
OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS’ JUNE 12, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE  
AND CROSS-MOTION.....1069**

AAG Kerwin’s July 21, 2017 Notice of Cross-Motion.....1069

AAG Kerwin’s July 21, 2017 Affirmation in Opposition  
& in Support of Cross-Motion.....1071

Exhibit A: Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits).....87

Exhibit B: Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....527

Exhibit C: Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer,  
signed & verified by AAG Kerwin.....548

Exhibit D: Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause,  
as signed by Judge Hartman .....536

Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 Moving Affidavit.....538

Plaintiffs’ Exhibit U analysis of December 21, 2016 Decision .....554

Exhibit E: Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order.....49  
transmitting May 5, 2017 letter.....1079

Exhibit F: Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order .....52

Exhibit G: Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause,  
as signed by Judge Hartman .....635

Plaintiffs’ May 15, 2017 Reply Memorandum of Law.....922

Exhibit H: Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order.....68

Exhibit I: Chapter 60, Part E, of the Laws of 2015 – Commission on  
Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation .....1080

Exhibit J: December 24, 2015 Report of the Commission on Legislative,  
Judicial and Executive Compensation .....1083

<u>Exhibit K:</u>	March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint in plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action (w/o exhibits).....	226
	Table of Exhibits to plaintiffs’ March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint and back .....	1106
<u>Exhibit L:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2014 Order to Show Cause for a Stay with TRO in prior citizen-taxpayer action, as signed by Supreme Court Justice Michael Lynch .....	1113
<u>Exhibit M:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2014 letter to Justice Lynch.....	1115
	Justice Lynch’s April 1, 2014 So-Ordered Letter .....	1118
	Justice Lynch’ March 31, 2014 So-Ordered Letter .....	1119
<u>Exhibit N:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 16, 2014 Notice of Cross-Motion .....	1120
	Plaintiffs’ May 16, 2014 Supporting Memorandum of Law .....	1123
<u>Exhibit O:</u>	Judge McDonough’s October 9, 2014 Decision and Order .....	326
<u>Exhibit P:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2015 Notice of Motion .....	1161
	Plaintiff Sassower’s_March 31, 2015_Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits) .....	1163
<u>Exhibit Q:</u>	Judge McDonough’s June 24, 2015 Decision and Order .....	335
<u>Exhibit R:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 22, 2015 Notice of Cross-Motion .....	1171
	Plaintiff Sassower’s September 22, 2015 Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits) .....	1174
<u>Exhibit S:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 23, 2016 Emergency Order to Show Cause with Stay & TRO, as signed by Judge McDonough.....	1182
	Plaintiff Sassower’s March 23, 2016 Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits) .....	1185
<u>Exhibit T:</u>	Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order.....	315
<u>Exhibit U:</u>	Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis of Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order .....	338
<u>Exhibit V:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2014 e-mail.....	1189



	Plaintiffs’ May 8, 2014 e-mail, with transmitted May 8, 2014 letter to Judge McDonough.....	1191
<u>Exhibit W:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2014 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1193
	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG Kerwin, cc: AAG McGowen .....	1194
	AAG McGowan’s May 2, 2014 e-mail.....	1195
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG McGowan, cc: AAG Kerwin .....	1196
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to Deputy Comptroller Robert Ward, etc., with enclosed May 2, 2014 complaint to Comptroller DiNapoli’s Investigations Unit.....	1199
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG McGowan, cc: AAG Kerwin, with enclosed October 9, 2013 e-mail to scholars.....	1201
	Plaintiffs’ May 17, 2014 e-mail to AAGs Kerwin, McGowan, cc to Comptroller’s office .....	1203
	Plaintiffs’ May 21, 2014 e-mail to Attorney General Schneiderman’s Intergovernmental Affairs Bureau Director, with enclosed May 16, 2014 Notice of Cross-Motion.....	1204
	Plaintiffs’ June 6, 2014 e-mail to AAGs Kerwin, McGowan.....	1210
	Plaintiffs’ March 26, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1211
	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1212
	Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1213
	Plaintiffs’ March 11, 2016 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1214
<u>Exhibit X:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “further notice to the highest supervisory levels of the Attorney General’s office” .....	860
	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman .....	852
	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting	

	of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction” .....	861
	Judge Hartman’s March 31, 2017 letter .....	872
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman .....	838
	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction” .....	861
<u>Exhibit Y:</u>	Plaintiffs’ February 24, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1216
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Jeffrey Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail .....	841
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “adjournment request & notice to Attorney General” .....	842
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	843
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Concerns” .....	844
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	845
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Thank you” .....	846
	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Awaiting the results of your review” .....	847
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail.....	848
	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “handled appropriately in all respects by this office?” .....	849
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail .....	850
	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Meg Levine: “YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED” .....	851
	AAG Supervisor Meg Levine’s March 28, 2017 e-mail:	

“RE: YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED” .....	858
Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to AAG Supervisor Levine: “GOING UP THE SUPERVISORY LADDER – INCLUDING TO AG SCHNEIDERMAN” .....	859
Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Levine, etc.: “Request that the AG rise above his conflict of interest & do his duty to secure the TRO to which plaintiffs were entitled yesterday, as a matter of law” .....	863
Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to AAG Lynch: “Your letter of retraction to Justice Hartman” .....	868
Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.: “IMMEDIATE OVERSIGHT & ACTION REQUIRED” .....	870
Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “NYS BUDGET & the AG’s DUTY TO IMMEDIATELY SECURE A TRO, etc.” .....	873
Plaintiffs’ April 5, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “...Your duty to advise your co-defendant clients of their treason to the NYS Constitution by their behind-closed-doors, ‘3-men-in- a-room’-‘amended’ budget bills – violating Article VII, §§4, 5, 6 and Article III, §10” .....	875
<u>Exhibit Z:</u> webpages from CJA’s website: <i>Doris L. Sassower v. Mangano</i> federal action; <i>Elena Sassower v. New York Times</i> state action; <i>Elena Sassower v. Commission on Judicial Conduct</i> Article 78 proceeding .....	1218
<u>Exhibit AA:</u> “ <i>Refusal to Apologize Costs Judicial Watchdog 6 Months</i> ” (NYLJ, July 8, 2004, at p. 1), reprinted in Parentadvocates.org .....	1244
<u>Defendants’ July 21, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Opposition and in Support of Cross-Motion</u> .....	1247
<b><u>PLAINTIFFS’ JULY 27, 2017 LETTER TO JUDGE HARTMAN, “...&amp; NOTICE TO THE ATTORNEY GENERAL”</u></b> .....	1282
<b><u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s AUGUST 7, 2017 SO-ORDERED LETTER</u></b> .....	1292

**PLAINTIFFS’ AUGUST 25, 2017 REPLY IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF THEIR  
JUNE 12, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE AND IN OPPOSITION TO  
DEFENDANTS’ JULY 21, 2017 CROSS-MOTION**.....1274

Plaintiff Sassower’s August 25, 2017 Affidavit in Reply and in Opposition.....1274

Exhibit H-1: Plaintiffs’ July 27, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman,  
“...& NOTICE TO THE ATTORNEY GENERAL” .....1282

Exhibit H-2: Judge Hartman’s August 7, 2017 So-Ordered Letter .....1292

Exhibit I: Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis  
of Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order .....1293

Exhibit J: Plaintiffs’ June 16, 2017 complaint to Commission on Judicial  
Conduct: “Conflict-of-interest/corruption complaint against Acting  
Supreme Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman  
for willfully violating judicial disclosure/disqualification rules in  
order to ‘throw’ a citizen-taxpayer action in which she is  
financially interested & has personal and professional relationships  
with defendants” .....1320

Plaintiffs’ August 25, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Reply & in Opposition  
to Cross-Motion .....1238

Affidavits of Service for Plaintiffs’ Reply Affidavit & Memorandum of Law, with  
transmitting e-mails –  
“I hereby reiterate the NOTICE that I gave you on July 27, 2017, to WITHDRAW  
AAG KERWIN’s OPPOSITION/CROSS-MOTION – which is your duty to do,  
as likewise, to join in plaintiffs’ application, by their August 25<sup>th</sup> reply papers, for  
Judge Hartman’s disqualification and vacatur of her decision/orders – all  
fraudulent” .....1383

**Plaintiffs’ Stipulation in Lieu of Certification Pursuant to CPLR §5532**