

*To Be Argued By:
Elena Ruth Sassower*

New York County Clerk's Index No. 108551/99

NEW YORK SUPREME COURT
Appellate Division -- First Department

ELENA RUTH SASSOWER, Coordinator
of the Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc.,
acting *pro bono publico*,

Petitioner-Appellant,

-against-

COMMISSION ON JUDICIAL CONDUCT
OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK,

Respondent-Respondent.

PETITIONER-APPELLANT'S BRIEF

ELENA RUTH SASSOWER
Petitioner-Appellant *Pro Se*
Box 69, Gedney Station
White Plains, New York 10605-0069
(914) 421-1200

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES..... i

QUESTIONS PRESENTED..... 1

INTRODUCTION..... 2

STATEMENT OF THE CASE..... 5

 A. Precipitating Background Facts..... 5

 B. The Verified Article 78 Petition..... 10

 C. Proceedings in the Supreme Court..... 13

 D. The January 31, 2000 Decision, Order & Judgment..... 35

ARGUMENT..... 36

PRELIMINARY STATEMENT..... 36

POINT I..... 39

 The Administrative Judge’s Violation Of “Random Selection”
 Rules To “Steer” The Case To Justice Wetzel, Where,
 Additionally, Petitioner Was Given No Notice And Opportunity To
 Be Heard, Entitled Her To The Granting Of Her Recusal
 Application Based Thereon

POINT II..... 42

 Petitioner’s December 2, 1999 Application For Justice Wetzel’s
 Recusal Entitled Her To His Recusal For Interest And Bias

POINT III 52

Justice Wetzel's Decision Is *Prima Facie* Proof Of His Disqualifying Actual Bias And Is Unconstitutional For That Reason, As Well As Its Lack of Any Factual Or Legal Support

- A. The Decision Fails To Make Findings As To The Threshold Issues Particularized, Factually And Legally, By Petitioner's Omnibus Motion..... 53**
- B. The Decision's Dismissal Of The Article 78 Petition Is Legally Unsupported And Insupportable And Rests On Wilful Falsification Of The Factual Record..... 54**
- C. The Decision's Injunction Against Petitioner And The *Non-Party* CJA Is *Sua Sponte*, Without Affording Them Notice And Opportunity To Be Heard, And Without Basis In Fact Or Law 61**

POINT IV 69

The Record Establishes That A Fair and Impartial Tribunal Would Have Been Required To Grant The Relief Requested By Petitioner's Verified Petition And Omnibus Motion

CONCLUSION 70

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases Cited

<i>AG Ship Maintenance v. Lezak</i> , 69 N.Y.2d 1 (1986).....	67
<i>Ames Dep't Stores, Inc, In Re</i> , 76 F.2d 66 (2d Cir. 1996).....	62
<i>Bolte, Matter of</i> , 97 A.D. 551(1 st Dept. 1904).....	4
<i>Bruckner v. Jaitor Apts. Co.</i> , 147 Misc.2d 796, 555 N.Y.S.2d 563 147 Misc.2d 796 (Civil Ct, Queens, 1990).....	63
<i>Capshaw, Matter of</i> , 258 A.D. 470 (1 st Dept 1940).....	4
<i>Droege, Matter of</i> , 129 A.D. 866 (1 st Dept. 1909).....	4
<i>Dubai Bank Limited v. Ayyub</i> , 187 A.D.2 373, 589, N.Y.S.2d 486 (1 st Dept. 1992).....	63
<i>Fitzgerald v. Tamola</i> , 199 A.D.2d 122, 605 N.Y.S.2d 67 (1st Dept. 1993).....	51
<i>Garner v. State of Louisiana</i> , 368 U.S. 157 (1961).....	52
<i>Goodman v. Goodman</i> , 228 A.D.2d 388, 644 N.Y.S.2d 731 (1 st Dept. 1996).....	51
<i>Gramatan Home v. Lopez</i> , 46 N.Y.2d 481 (1979).....	55, 57
<i>Hartford Tile Corp., Matter of</i> , 613 F.2d 388 (2 nd Cir. 1979).....	62
<i>Holt v. Virginia</i> , 381 U.S. 131 (1965).....	65
<i>Johnson v. Hornblass</i> , 93 A.D.2d 732, 461 N.Y.S.2d 277 (1 st Dept. 1983).....	36, 50
<i>Kuehne & Nagel, Inc. v. Baiden</i> , 36 N.Y.2d 599 (1975).....	39
<i>Kurz v. Justices of the Supreme Court of New York, Kings County</i> , 228 A.D.2d 74, 654 N.Y.S.2d 783 (2nd Dept. 1997).....	40

<i>Ted Lapidus, S.A. v. Vann</i> , 112 F.3d 91 (2 nd Cir. 1997).....	62
<i>Laye v. Shepard</i> , 48 Misc.2d 478, 265 N.Y.S.2d 142 (1965), aff'd 267 N.Y.S.2d 477 (1 st Dept. 1966).....	39
<i>Leventritt v. Eckstein</i> , 206 A.D.2d 313, 615 N.Y.S.2d (1st Dept. 1994).....	51
<i>Mantell v. New York State Commission on Judicial Conduct</i> , NY Co. #08655/99 [A-299].....	24, 31, 33, 58
<i>Marcus v. Bamberger</i> , 180 A.D.2d 533, 580 N.Y.S.2d 256 (1 st Dept. 1992).....	63
<i>McCormick v. Walker</i> , 142 NYS 759, 764, aff'd, 158 A.D. 54 (1 st Dept 1913).....	36
<i>Merola v. Walsh, Matter of</i> , 75 A.D.2d 163 (1st Dept. 1980).....	36
<i>Morfesis v. Wilk</i> , 138 A.D.2d 244, 525 N.Y.S.2d 599 (1st Dept 1988)	40
<i>Murphy, Matter of</i> , 82 N.Y.2d 491, 605 N.Y.S.2d 232 (1993).....	51
<i>People v. Conroy</i> , 90 N.Y. 62 (1884).....	39
<i>People v. Moreno</i> , 70 N.Y.2d 403, 521 N.Y.S.2d 663 (1987).....	50
<i>People v. Rodriguez</i> , 180 A.D.2d 578, 580 N.Y.S.2d 292 (1 st Dept. 1992).....	63
<i>People v. Whitridge</i> , 144 A.D. 493, 129 N.Y.S. 300 (1st Dept 1911).....	46
<i>Rotwein, Matter of</i> , 291 N.Y. 116 (1943).....	50
<i>Doris L. Sassower v. Commission on Judicial Conduct of the State of New York</i> (unpublished decision) NY Co. #109141/95 [A-189].....	6, 24, 55, 56, 57, 58
<i>George Sassower and Doris L. Sassower v. Signorelli</i> , 99 A.D.2d 358 (2d Dept. 1984).....	25, 66, 67, 68
<i>Schlaifer Nance & Co., Inc. v. Estate of Warhol</i> , 194 F.3d 323 (2 nd Cir. 1999).....	62

<i>Schwartz v. Public Administrator of County of Bronx</i> , 24 N.Y.2d 65 (1969)	55
<i>Shrager v. NY University</i> , 227 A.D.2d 189, 642 N.Y.S.2d 243 (1st Dept. 1996)	50
<i>60 East 80th Street Equities, Inc., In Re</i> , 218 F.3d 109 (2 nd Cir. 2000).....	62
<i>Thompson v. City of Louisville</i> , 362 U.S. 199 (1960)	52
<i>U.S. v. Bayless</i> , 201 F.3d 116 (2 nd Cir. 2000).....	45
<i>Whitmore v. J. Jungman, Inc.</i> , 129 N.Y.S. 776 (S.Ct., N.Y Co. 1911).....	39
<i>Yannitelli v. D. Yannitelli & Sons Const.</i> , 247 A.D.2d 271, 668 N.Y.S.2d 613 (1st Dept. 1998).....	50

Constitutional Provisions

New York State Constitution

Article VI, §6c	46
Article VI, §9	46
Article VI, §20	2, 36
Article VI, §22a	10, 11
Article VI, §28c	2, 36
Article VI, §30	68

Statutes

Executive Law §63.1	19, 25, 32, 53, 66
Judiciary Law §14	1, 8, 31, 38, 44, 46, 49
Judiciary Law §41.2	8, 11
Judiciary Law §41.4	7
Judiciary Law §§41.6	11
Judiciary Law §43.1	7, 11
Judiciary Law §44.1	5, 7, 9, 10, 11, 12
Judiciary Law §45	7, 8, 11
Judiciary Law §210(1)(b)	68
Judiciary Law §487	21

Uncertain Justice: The Reports of the Task Forces of Citizens for Independent Courts, Century Foundation Press, NY, 2000, 242 pp..... 46

Flamm, Richard E., **Judicial Disqualification**, Little, Brown & Co., 1996, 1185 pp..... 38, 45, 50

Stempel, Jeffrey W., ***Rehnquist, Recusal and Reform***, 53 **Brooklyn Law Review** 589 (1987)..... 50